LLVMLinux: The Linux Kernel with Dragon Wings

Presented by:
Jan-Simon Möller
(LLVMLinux Maintainer for x86)

Presentation Date: 2014.02.02
Why Would I Want to Use Clang/LLVM to Compile the Linux Kernel?
Fast Compiles

- Clang compiles code faster and use less memory than other toolchains

Timed ImageMagick Compilation v6.8.1-10

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Compiler</th>
<th>Time To Compile (Seconds)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>GCC 4.7.2</td>
<td>58.05</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GCC 4.8.0</td>
<td>59.67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LLVM Clang 3.2</td>
<td>25.03</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LLVM Clang 3.3 SVN</td>
<td>24.79</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Powered By Phoronix Test Suite 4.4.1

http://www.phoronix.com/scan.php?page=article&item=llvm_33svn_competes&num=1
Fast Moving Project

In just a few years Clang has reached and in some cases surpassed what other toolchains can do.

### LAMMPS Molecular Dynamics Simulator v1.0
**Test: Rhodopsin Protein**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Compiler</th>
<th>Loop Time, Less Is Better</th>
<th>SE +/-</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>GCC 4.7.2</td>
<td>49.36</td>
<td>0.18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GCC 4.8.0</td>
<td>48.46</td>
<td>0.14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LLVM Clang 3.2</td>
<td>49.71</td>
<td>0.07</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LLVM Clang 3.3 SVN</td>
<td>41.36</td>
<td>0.09</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1. (CXX) g++ options: -lfftw -lmcll

Powered By Phoronix Test Suite 4.4.1

http://www.phoronix.com/scan.php?page=article&item=llvm_33svn_competes&num=1
One Toolchain

- Compiler extensions only need to be written once
- LLVM is already being used in a lot of domains:
  - Audio
  - Video (llvmpipe)
  - CUDA
  - Renderscript
  - Kernel
  - Userspace
  - Applications
  - Documentation
  - HPC
for_each_opt(opt, lecup options, NULL) {
    if (optarg && strcasecmp("0x", optarg, 2) == 0)
        base = 16;
    else
        base = 10;
    switch (opt) {
        case 'H':
            handle = strtoul(optarg, NULL, base);
            break;
        case 'm':
            min = strtoul(optarg, NULL, base);
            break;
        case 'M':
            max = strtoul(optarg, NULL, base);
            break;
        case 'l':
            latency = strtoul(optarg, NULL, base);
            break;
        case 't':
            timeout = strtoul(optarg, NULL, base);
            break;
    }
}
Security

Talking about Linux kernel security surrounding recent events involving the NSA...

"I also think this is a reason that having multiple independent compilers that are structurally very different (gcc/llvm) could give a potential security advantage. It's harder in practice to create a "rtt" attack that works simultaneously against two independently moving targets."

- Michael K Johnson
Other Kinds of Things

- Google is using a tool based on LLVM to look for common bugs in their vast library code.
- Once bugs are found they are fixed automatically with minimal human involvement.
  - http://youtu.be/mVbDzTM21BQ
- Conceivably something similar could be built to look for common bugs in the kernel code so that bugs could be found earlier.
more Other Kinds of Things

Energy consumption of Instructions – see talks
- “Who ate my battery?”
- “An approach for energy consumption analysis of programs using LLVM”

Think of an application compiled to LLVM-IR, JIT-ed to either performance or powersave mode

Hmm crazy: … could that even be done with the kernel or a module ?!?!
Clang/LLVM already used by Linux Projects

- LLVM part of Renderscript compiler in Android
  - Supported on ARM, MIPS and x86
- Clang part of the Android NDK
- LLVM is used in Gallium3D
  - llvmpipe driver, Clover (Open CL)
  - GLSL shader optimizer
- Clang built Debian - Sylvestre Ledru
The LLVMLinux Project
The LLVMProject Goals

- Fully build the Linux kernel for multiple architectures, using the Clang/LLVM toolchain
- Discover LLVM/Kernel issues early and find fixes quickly across both communities
- Upstream patches to the Linux Kernel and LLVM projects
- Bring together like-minded developers
LLVMLinux Automated Build Framework

- git clone http://git.linuxfoundation.org/llvmlinux.git
- The framework consists of scripts and patches
- Automates fetching, patching, and building
  - LLVM, Clang,
  - Toolchains for cross assembler, linker
  - Linux Kernel
  - QEMU, and test images
Patch management using quilt
Choice of clang compiler
  - From-source, prebuilt, native
Choice of gnu cross-toolchain (as, ld)
  - Codesourcery, Linaro, Android, native

$ cd targets/vexpress
$ make CLANG_TOOLCHAIN=prebuilt kernel-build
$ make CROSS_ARM_TOOLCHAIN=linaro kernel-build
LLVMLinux Automated Build Framework

- Example make targets
  
  $ cd targets/vexpress
  
  $ make sync-all kernel-build test-boot-poweroff
  
  $ make clean all
  
  $ make llvm-clean clang-build
  
  $ make list-patches-applied
  
  $ make help
Current support for various targets

- X86_64 (mainline)
- Versatile Express (QEMU testing mainline)
- Qualcomm MSM (3.4)
- Raspberry-pi (3.2 and 3.6)
- Nexus 7 (3.1.10), Galaxy S3 (3.0.59 in progress)
- BeagleBone (3.8 in progress)
- Arm64 (mainline in progress)
Buildbot

- Buildbot Continuous Integration Server
- Builds and tests LLVMLinux Code
- Builds and retests on every commit to the LLVM, Clang, and the Linux Kernel repos
- Also builds/tests the patched Linux Kernel with gcc to make sure not to break compatibility
- Runs LTP tests in QEMU for Versatile Express
Status of Building Linux Kernel With Clang/LLVM
LLVM for Linux Status

- All required patches are now upstream
- The kernel can be compiled with Clang 3.4 (with the LLVMLinux kernel patches)
- Any new issues introduced to LLVM which break the Kernel are being fixed as they are being found by the LLVMLinux team with help from LLVM developers
- New development: .code16 support just landed in 3.5svn (Kudos: David Woodhouse)
Challenges Using Clang/LLVM to Build the Linux Kernel
Challenges Using Clang for Cross Compilation

- GCC Dependencies:
  - gcc conforms to gnu90, clang to gnu99
  - Kernel currently expects some undocumented GCC behavior
  - Unsupported GCC extensions and flags
  - __builtin function differences
Kbuild is GCC specific

- GCC returns false for unsupported flag and issues warning
- Clang returns true for unused flag and issues warning
- This means that special versions of things like cc-option macro need to be provided
- Kbuild requires patches to support clang
- New in clang 3.4svn, follows gcc behaviour
Kbuild is GCC specific

- GCC returns false for unsupported flag and issues warning
- Clang returns true for unused flag and issues warning
- This means that special versions of things like cc-option macro need to be provided
- Kbuild requires patches to support clang
- New in clang 3.4svn, follows gcc behaviour
Unsupported GCC Language Extensions

- Named register variables are not supported
  
  ```
  register unsigned long current_stack_pointer asm("esp") __used;
  ```

  Proposed by LLVMLinux project

- `__builtin_stack_pointer()`

- Arch independent, in line with existing `__builtin_frame_pointer()`

- Patch for LLVM available, looking to have a similar patch for gcc

  Proposed by Jakob Stoklund Olesen (works with gcc and LLVM 3.3):

  ```
  register unsigned long current_stack_pointer asm("esp") __used;
  asm("" : "=r"(esp));
  ```
Unsupported GCC Language Extensions

- Variable Length Arrays In Structs (VLAIS) aren't supported in Clang (gcc extension)

```c
struct foo_t {
    char a[n]; /* Explicitly not allowed by C99/C11 */
    int b;
} foo;
```

- VLAs outside of structures are supported (gcc and llvm)

```c
char foo[n];
```

- VLAIS is used in the Linux kernel in the netfilter code, the kernel hashing (HMAC) routines, gadget driver, mac80211(aes), bluetooth and possibly other places - mostly through reusing patterns from datastructures found in crypto
Nested Functions

Thinkpad ACPI Driver still uses Nested Functions

```c
static void hotkey_compare_and_issue_event(
    struct tp_nvram_state *oldn,
    struct tp_nvram_state *newn,
    const u32 event_mask)
{
    ...
    void issue_volchange(const unsigned int oldvol,
                         const unsigned int newvol)
    ...
    void issue_brightnesschange(const unsigned int oldbrt,
                                  const unsigned int newbrt)
    ...
}
```

Patch submitted (haven't heard back from the maintainer)
Incompatibilities with GCC

- `__attribute ((alias))` is used for modules.
- An alias doesn't copy over other attributes.
- Since `__section()` isn't copied over, init and exit link sections need to be reapplied.
- We saw a lot of section mismatches reported by modpost. This was caused by the “MergedGlobals” optimization of clang. For modpost and others to work properly, we use “–no-merged-globals”.

Extern inline is different for gnu89 and gnu99

- GNU89
  - Function will be inlined where it is used
  - No function definition is emitted
  - A non-inlined function can also be provided

- GNU99 (C99)
  - Function will be inlined where it is used
  - An external function is emitted
  - No other function of the same name can be provided.

Solution? Use “static inline” instead.
This code doesn't work in clang but does in gcc

```c
--- a/crypto/shash.c
+++ b/crypto/shash.c
@@ -67,7 +67,8 @@ EXPORT_SYMBOL_GPL(crypto_shash_setkey);
     static inline unsigned int shash_align_buffer_size(unsigned len,
                 unsigned long mask)
     {
-       return len + (mask & ~(__alignof__(u8 __attribute__ ((aligned))) - 1));
+       typedef __attribute__ ((aligned)) u8 u8_aligned;
+       return len + (mask & ~(__alignof__(u8_aligned) - 1));
     }
```

- Clang has troubles with this statement as written
- Making it into 2 lines makes it more readable and works in both compilers
Challenges Using Clang for Cross Compilation

- The Integrated Assembler (IA) can't be used
  - Doesn't support .code16 solved 3.5+
  - ARM Kernel code isn't in Unified Format
- Dependence on GNU toolchain for assembly and linking (as and ld)
- Configuring GNU toolchain dependencies (-gcc-toolchain <path>)
Kernel Patches

- The patches that still need to make it upstream

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Architecture</th>
<th>Number of patches</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>all</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>arm</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>aarch64</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>x86_64</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
What's Left to Do?
Todos

- Upstream patches
- Test and fix drivers/subsystems which haven't been tested yet or are known not to work
- VLAIS – crypto, netfilter, ...
- Weak alias + section attributes
- Enable Clang IA (i.e. rewriting ARM ASM in unified format)
How Can I Help?

- Make it known you want to be able to use Clang to compile the kernel
- Test LLVMLinux patches
- Report bugs to the mailing list
- Help get LLVMLinux patches upstream
- Work on unsupported features and Bugs
- Submit new targets and arch support
- Patches welcome
Who wouldn't want a penguin with dragon wings?

Thank you

http://llvm.linuxfoundation.org
Contribute to the LLVMLinux Project

- Project wiki page
  - http://llvm.linuxfoundation.org
- Project Mailing List
  - http://lists.linuxfoundation.org/mailman/listinfo/llvmlinux
  - http://lists.linuxfoundation.org/pipermail/llvmlinux/
- IRC Channel
  - #llvmlinux on OFTC
  - http://buildbot.llvm.linuxfoundation.org/irclogs/OFTC/%23llvmlinux/
LLVMLinux: The Linux Kernel with Dragon Wings

Presented by:
Jan-Simon Möller
(LLVMLinux Maintainer for x86)

Presentation Date: 2014.02.02
Why Would I Want to Use Clang/LLVM to Compile the Linux Kernel?
Fast Compiles

- Clang compiles code faster and use less memory than other toolchains

Timed ImageMagick Compilation v6.8.1-10
Time To Compile

- GCC 4.7.2: 58.05
- GCC 4.8.0: 59.67
- LLVM Clang 3.2: 25.01
- LLVM Clang 3.3 SVN: 24.79

powered by Phoronix Test Suite 4.4.1

http://www.phoronix.com/scan.php?page=article&item=llvm_33svn_competes&num=1
Fast Moving Project

In just a few years Clang has reached and in some cases surpassed what other toolchains can do.
One Toolchain

- Compiler extensions only need to be written once
- LLVM is already being used in a lot of domains:
  - Audio
  - Video (llvmpipe)
  - CUDA
  - Renderscript
  - Kernel
  - Userspace
  - Applications
  - Documentation
  - HPC
Quickly mention this.

Checker support is being added to LLVMLinux
Security

Talking about Linux kernel security surrounding recent events involving the NSA...

"I also think this is a reason that having multiple independent compilers that are structurally very different (gcc/llvm) could give a potential security advantage. It's harder in practice to create a "rtt" attack that works simultaneously against two independently moving targets."

- Michael K Johnson

RTT → Round Trip Time
RTT → Remote Timing Technique
Other Kinds of Things

- Google is using a tool based on LLVM to look for common bugs in their vast library code.
- Once bugs are found, they are fixed automatically with minimal human involvement.
  - [http://youtu.be/mVbDzTM21BQ](http://youtu.be/mVbDzTM21BQ)
- Conceivably something similar could be built to look for common bugs in the kernel code so that bugs could be found earlier.
more Other Kinds of Things

- Energy consumption of Instructions – see talks
  - “Who ate my battery?”
  - “An approach for energy consumption analysis of programs using LLVM”
- Think of an application compiled to LLVM-IR, JIT-ed to either performance or powersave mode
- Hmm crazy: … could that even be done with the kernel or a module?!?!
Clang/LLVM already used by Linux Projects

- LLVM part of Renderscript compiler in Android
- Supported on ARM, MIPS and x86
- Clang part of the Android NDK
- LLVM is used in Gallium3D
  - llvmpipe driver, Clover (Open CL)
  - GLSL shader optimizer
- Clang built Debian - Sylvestre Ledru

Quick Slide
The LLVMLinux Project
The LLVM Project Goals

- Fully build the Linux kernel for multiple architectures, using the Clang/LLVM toolchain
- Discover LLVM/Kernel issues early and find fixes quickly across both communities
- Upstream patches to the Linux Kernel and LLVM projects
- Bring together like-minded developers

And Vinicius Tinti for his work on rpi and Android
Especially Jan-Simon Moeller for and PaxTeam
x86_64
And Mark Charlebois for his work on MSM
PaxTeam

Bryce Lelbach
Edwin Torok
Sedat Dilek
LLVMLinux Automated Build Framework

- git clone http://git.linuxfoundation.org/llvmlinux.git
- The framework consists of scripts and patches
- Automates fetching, patching, and building
  - LLVM, Clang,
  - Toolchains for cross assembler, linker
  - Linux Kernel
  - QEMU, and test images

Concentrate on what the build framework does.
LLVMLinux Automated Build Framework

- Patch management using quilt
- Choice of clang compiler
  - From-source, prebuilt, native
- Choice of gnu cross-toolchain (as, ld)
  - Codesourcery, Linaro, Android, native

$ cd targets/vexpress
$ make CLANG_TOOLCHAIN=prebuilt kernel-build
$ make CROSS_ARM_TOOLCHAIN=linaro kernel-build
$ make list-versions
List versions of all tools and code from downloaded repos
  $ make list-kernel-patches
List all kernel patches for target kernel
  $ make list-patch-applied
List all patches currently applied to all downloaded repos
  $ make list-targets
List all build targets
  $ make kernel-build
Build the kernel with clang
    $ make kernel-gcc-build
Build the kernel with gcc
  $ make test-kill
Test boot clang built kernel in qemu
LLVMLinux Automated Build Framework

Current support for various targets

- X86_64 (mainline)
- Versatile Express (QEMU testing mainline)
- Qualcomm MSM (3.4)
- Raspberry-pi (3.2 and 3.6)
- Nexus 7 (3.1.10), Galaxy S3 (3.0.59 in progress)
- BeagleBone (3.8 in progress)
- Arm64 (mainline in progress)

Quick Slide
You can get to the buildbot from the project wiki. Buildbot status is on the project wiki too.
Status of Building Linux Kernel With Clang/LLVM
LLVM for Linux Status

- All required patches are now upstream
- The kernel can be compiled with Clang 3.4 (with the LLVMLinux kernel patches)
- Any new issues introduced to LLVM which break the Kernel are being fixed as they are being found by the LLVMLinux team with help from LLVM developers
- New development: .code16 support just landed in 3.5svn (Kudos: David Woodhouse)

64-bit support through using paired registers.
1 Clang patch, 1 LLVM patch
Challenges Using Clang/LLVM to Build the Linux Kernel
Challenges Using Clang for Cross Compilation

- GCC Dependencies:
  - gcc conforms to gnu90, clang to gnu99
  - Kernel currently expects some undocumented GCC behavior
  - Unsupported GCC extensions and flags
  - __builtin function differences
Kbuild is GCC specific

- GCC returns false for unsupported flag and issues warning
- Clang returns true for unused flag and issues warning
- This means that special versions of things like cc-option macro need to be provided
- Kbuild requires patches to support clang
- New in clang 3.4svn, follows gcc behaviour
Kbuild is GCC specific

- GCC returns false for unsupported flag and issues warning
- Clang returns true for unused flag and issues warning
- This means that special versions of things like `cc-option` macro need to be provided
- Kbuild requires patches to support clang
- New in clang 3.4svn, follows gcc behaviour
Unsupported GCC Language Extentions

- Named register variables are not supported
  register unsigned long current_stack_pointer asm("esp") __used;
  Proposed by LLVMLinux project
- __builtin_stack_pointer()
- Arch independent, in line with existing __builtin_frame_pointer()
- Patch for LLVM available, looking to have a similar patch for gcc
  Proposed by Jakob Stoklund Olesen (works with gcc and LLVM 3.3):
  register unsigned long current_stack_pointer asm("esp") __used;
  asm("" : "=r"(esp));
Unsupported GCC Language Extentions

- Variable Length Arrays In Structs (VLAIS) aren't supported in Clang (gcc extension)

```c
struct foo_t {
    char a[n]; /* Explicitly not allowed by C99/C11 */
    int b;
} foo;
```

- VLAs outside of structures are supported (gcc and llvm)

```c
char foo[n];
```

- VLAIS is used in the Linux kernel in the netfilter code, the kernel hashing (HMAC) routines, gadget driver, mac80211(aes), bluetooth and possibly other places - mostly through reusing patterns from datastructures found in crypto
Nested Functions

- Thinkpad ACPI Driver still uses Nested Functions

```c
static void hotkey_compare_and_issue_event(
    struct tp_nvram_state *oldn,
    struct tp_nvram_state *newn,
    const u32 event_mask)
{
    ...
    void issue_volchange(const unsigned int oldvol,
                          const unsigned int newvol)
    ...
    void issue_brightnesschange(const unsigned int oldbrt,
                                const unsigned int newbrt)
    ...
```

- Patch submitted (haven't heard back from the maintainer)
Incompatibilities with GCC

- __attribute__((alias)) is used for modules
- An alias doesn't copy over other attributes
- Since __section() isn't copied over, init and exit link sections need to be reapplied
- We saw a lot of section mismatches reported by modpost. This was caused by the “MergedGlobals” optimization of clang. For modpost and others to work properly, we use “-no-merged-globals”.
Extern inline is different for gnu89 and gnu99

- GNU89
  - Function will be inlined where it is used
  - No function definition is emitted
  - A non-inlined function can also be provided
- GNU99 (C99)
  - Function will be inlined where it is used
  - An external function is emitted
  - No other function of the same name can be provided.
  - Solution? Use “static inline” instead.

In traditional gcc, "extern inline" means that the function should be inlined wherever it is used, and no function definition should be emitted. Moreover, it is permitted to provide both an "extern inline" and a normal definition, in which case the normal definition takes precedence. In traditional gcc, "inline" without "extern" or "static" means that the function should be compiled inline where the inline definition is seen, and the compiler should also emit a copy of the function body with an externally visible symbol, as though the declaration appeared without "inline".

In C99, "extern inline" means that the function should be compiled inline where the inline definition is seen, and that the compiler should also emit a copy of the function body with an externally visible symbol. That is, C99 "extern inline" is equivalent to traditional gcc "inline". In C99, "inline" without "extern" or "static" means that the function should be compiled inline and that no externally visible function body should be emitted. That is, C99 "inline" is similar to traditional gcc "extern inline", although there is no equivalent ability to override the inline definition with a non-inline definition.
This code doesn't work in clang but does in gcc

```c
--- a/crypto/shash.c
+++ b/crypto/shash.c
@@ -67,7 +67,8 @@ EXPORT_SYMBOL_GPL(crypto_shash_setkey);
 static inline unsigned int shash_align_buffer_size(unsigned len,
             unsigned long mask)
 { -
+       typedef __attribute__ ((aligned)) u8 u8_aligned;
       return len + (mask & ~(__alignof__(u8_aligned) - 1));
 }

 Clang has troubles with this statement as written
 Making it into 2 lines makes it more readable and works in both compilers
Challenges Using Clang for Cross Compilation

- The Integrated Assembler (IA) can't be used
  - Doesn't support .code16, solved 3.5+
  - ARM Kernel code isn't in Unified Format
- Dependence on GNU toolchain for assembly and linking (as and ld)
- Configuring GNU toolchain dependencies (-gcc-toolchain <path>)
Kernel Patches

- The patches that still need to make it upstream

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Architecture</th>
<th>Number of patches</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>all</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>arm</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>aarch64</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>x86_64</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
What's Left to Do?
Todos

- Upstream patches
- Test and fix drivers/subsystems which haven't been tested yet or are known not to work
  http://llvm.linuxfoundation.org/index.php/Broken_kernel_options
- VLAIS – crypto, netfilter,…
- Weak alias + section attributes
- Enable Clang IA (i.e. rewriting ARM ASM in unified format)

Not a definitive list.

There is a lot more on the Roadmap page on the wiki.
How Can I Help?

- Make it known you want to be able to use Clang to compile the kernel
- Test LLVMLinux patches
- Report bugs to the mailing list
- Help get LLVMLinux patches upstream
- Work on unsupported features and Bugs
- Submit new targets and arch support
- Patches welcome

Last real slide.

We can take our time here.
Who wouldn't want a penguin with dragon wings?

Thank you

http://llvm.linuxfoundation.org

End of slide deck.

Recap contact slide is next.
Contribute to the LLVMLinux Project

- Project wiki page
  - http://llvm.linuxfoundation.org
- Project Mailing List
  - http://lists.linuxfoundation.org/mailman/listinfo/llvmlinux
  - http://lists.linuxfoundation.org/pipermail/llvmlinux/
- IRC Channel
  - #llvmlinux on OFTC
  - http://buildbot.llvm.linuxfoundation.org/irclogs/OFTC/%23llvmlinux/

Leave this up at the end.